DE-IDENTIFIED PRE-TRIAL DEPOSITION TESTIMONY OF A GENERAL DENTIST IN A CASE INVOLVING THE EXTRACTION OF 2 PERMANENT TEETH INSTEAD OF 2 BABY TEETH

```
SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
    COUNTY OF
 3
 4
       as M/N/G OF
      , an infant, and
 5
       , Individually,
 6
                   Plaintiff,
 7
      -against-
                   Index No.
8
    D.D.S., P.C.
9
                   Defendants.
10
11
12
13
14
15
                   10:00 a.m.
16
       EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of
                 , D.D.S., the Defendant herein,
17
    taken by the Plaintiffs, pursuant to Article
18
19
    31 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules of
    Testimony and Order, held at the
21 above-mentioned time and place, before
22
           , Notary Public of the State of New
23 York.
24
25
0002
                                               2
1
2
    APPEARANCES:
3
    THE LAW OFFICE OF GERALD M. OGINSKI
 4
           Attorney for the Plaintiff
           25 Great Neck Road
 5
           Great Neck, New York 11021
 6
 7
           Attorney for the Defendant
 8
9
10
           Attorneys for the Defendant,
11
                 , P.C.
12
13
    BY:
14
15
```

```
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
2.4
25
0003
                                                  3
1
 2
                         STIPULATIONS
 3
        IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, by and between
 4
     the attorneys for the respective parties
 5
     hereto, that:
 6
        All rights provided by the C.P.L.R.,
 7
     and Part 221 of the Uniform Rules for the
 8
     Conduct of Depositions, including the right
 9
     to object to any question, except as to
10
     form, or to move to strike any testimony
11
     at this examination is reserved; and in
12
     addition, the failure to object to any question
13
     or to move to strike any testimony at this
14
     examination shall not be a bar or waiver to
15
     make such motion at, and is reserved to, the
     trial of this action.
16
17
        This deposition may be sworn to by the witness
18
     being examined before a Notary Public other than
19
     the Notary Public before whom this
20
     examination was begun, but the failure to do so
21
     or to return the original of this deposition
22
     to counsel, shall not be deemed a waiver of
23
     the rights provided by Rule 3116 of the C.P.L.R.,
24
     and shall be controlled thereby.
25
        The filing of the original of this
0004
1
                                                  4
 2
     deposition is waived.
 3
        IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED, a copy of this
 4
     examination shall be furnished to the
 5
     attorney for the witness being examined
 6
     without charge.
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
```

```
22
23
24
25
0005
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                     5
 3
     after having been first duly sworn by a
 4
     Notary Public of the State of New York, was
 5
     examined and testified as follows:
 6
     EXAMINATION BY
 7
     MR. OGINSKI:
 8
                  State your name for the record,
 9
     please?
10
            Α
11
                  State your address, please.
12
            Α
                  Business address is
13
14
15
                  MR. OGINSKI: Mark this,
16
            please.
17
                  (Plaintiff's Exhibit 1, Panorex
18
            X-rays, were marked for
19
            identification.)
20
                  MR. OGINSKI: Mark this,
21
            please.
22
                  (Plaintiff's Exhibits 2 and 3,
23
            Documents, were marked for
24
            identification.)
25
                  MR. : We'll stipulate
0006
1
                          , D.D.S.
2
            to accept service.
3
                  MR. OGINSKI: I was going to
4
            ask you that.
5
                  MR. : I know.
 6
                  MR. OGINSKI: Good morning,
7
            Doctor.
8
                  THE WITNESS: Good morning.
9
                  Did you remove
10
        's lower canines?
11
            Α
                  Yes.
12
                  That was done on
            Q
13
14
                  Correct.
            Α
15
                  Why did you remove the canines
            Q
16
     on her lower jaw?
17
                  Well, I reviewed the X-ray this
     morning and I mean it was a long time ago so
18
19
     I don't know exactly what was going through
     my head at the time, but from reviewing the
20
21
     X-rays this morning, it appears that the
22
     canines, at that time, I believe were
23
     children's canines.
24
                  What was the purpose of
25
     extracting any of those teeth that morning?
0007
                                        7
1
                          , D.D.S.
```

```
To gain space for orthodontic
 3
     movement of teeth.
                  Did you learn after extracting
            Q
 5
     those teeth they were not baby teeth; they
 6
     were, in fact, permanent teeth?
 7
                  MR. : Did he learn
8
            that before the lawsuit?
9
                  MR. OGINSKI: Yes.
10
            Α
11
                  What are supernumerary teeth?
            Q
12
                  Supernumerary teeth are extra
13
     teeth that most people don't have that some
14
     people do.
15
            Q
                  How do you distinguish
16
     supernumerary teeth from a normal regular
17
     tooth?
18
                 Generally by location but it
19
     could be very difficult to distinguish.
20
                 Is this something that can be
21
     distinguished visually by grossly looking at
22
     teeth?
23
                  Well, you have to distinguish
24
     them on an X-ray and on an X-ray, you know,
25
     a lot of teeth look very similar.
8000
1
                           , D.D.S.
 2
                  Are there instances where
 3
     supernumerary teeth are going in the
     incorrect position or incorrect direction?
 4
 5
                  It could be.
 6
                  What is a deciduous tooth?
            0
 7
                  I think that's the second --
            Α
8
     that's a permanent tooth.
9
                  What are cuspids, Doctor?
            Q
10
            Α
                  Canines.
11
                  What are bicuspids?
            Q.
12
            Α
                  Premolars.
13
                  And are those typically what
            Q
     you would call baby teeth?
14
15
                        : Which ones?
                  MR.
16
                  Bicuspids.
            MR. : I just want to object to form. Can you put the
17
18
19
            whole thing in one question?
20
                  MR. OGINSKI: Sure.
21
                  Can you have bicuspid baby
22
     teeth?
23
            Α
24
                  Does the word bicuspid refer to
            Q
25
     adult teeth?
0009
1
                           , D.D.S.
 2
                  Yes.
            Α
 3
                  What are canine teeth?
            Q.
            Α
                  Just like any other tooth, it's
 5
     just they are called canine because they are
     in a specific location. They have a
     specific function and appearance in the
```

```
mouth.
 9
                  And in terms of an adult mouth,
     can you tell me the numbers of the teeth
10
     that canines would represent?
11
12
                  Which numbering system?
13
                  Whatever you use, Doctor?
            Q
14
                  Six, 11, 22 and 27.
            Α
15
            0
                  Six, 11, 22 and --
16
            Α
                  Twenty-seven.
17
            Q
                  Is there a particular name for
18
     that numbering system that you just used?
19
                  Yeah, there is. I don't recall
20
     though.
21
                  What other systems are there
22
     besides the one that you just described?
23
        A There's also other numbering
24
     systems that you number from here over
25
     (indicating).
0010
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       10
 2
                  MR.
                         : Indicating the
 3
            front.
 4
                 Yeah, this would be one, two
 5
     three; one, two, three; one, two, three; one
 6
     two three.
 7
                        : The witness is
                  MR.
 8
            indicating from the center of the
 9
            mouth you would start the number
10
            system which would go in either
11
            direction out and increasing
12
            numbers.
13
            Α
                  Upper left three, you know,
14
     upper right three, lower right three.
15
                 Which system do you tend to
16
     use?
17
                  The first system.
18
                  And how many adult teeth are
            Q
19
     there generally?
20
                 Thirty-two.
            Α
21
                  And how many baby teeth are
22
     there generally?
23
            Α
                  Twenty.
24
            0
                  And when you're identifying
25
     baby teeth, how do you identify them in
0011
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       11
 2
     terms of number, letter or something else?
 3
                  Baby teeth generally are
     lettered whereas adult teeth are generally
 5
     numbers.
 6
                  What are premolars, Doctor?
 7
                  It's just another type of tooth
            Α
 8
     in the mouth.
 9
                  Where are those premolars
            Q.
10
     located? You can tell me based upon your
11
     numbering that you described.
12
                 That would be four, five, 12,
13
     13, 20, 21, 28, 29.
```

```
14
                  What is the maxilla?
            Q
15
                  Upper jaw.
            Α
                  And the mandible?
16
            Q
17
                  Lower jaw.
            Α
18
                  The first molar is where within
            Q
19
     the mouth?
20
                  It is from the back the third
            Α
21
     tooth in and from the front the six tooth
22
     back.
23
                  And is that true of baby teeth
24
     as well as adult teeth?
25
                  The first molar?
0012
1
                           , D.D.S. 12
 2
                  Yes.
            Q
 3
            Α
                  No.
 4
            Q
                  And for baby teeth, where is
 5
     the first molar?
 6
            Α
                  The first molar is directly
 7
     behind the baby canine.
 8
                  In an adult where is that first
            Q
 9
     molar located?
10
            Α
                  It's behind the premolars.
11
                  The cuspid is where?
            Q.
12
            Α
                  In front the premolars.
13
            Q
                  And what number teeth would you
14
     assign them for an adult?
15
            Α
                  The cuspids?
16
            Q
                  Yes.
17
            Α
                  Didn't I give you that already?
18
                  You talked about the canine and
            0
19
     you talked about the premolars?
20
                  The canines and the cuspids are
            Α
21
     the same.
22
                 And the premolars and the
            Q
23
     bicuspid you said are the same?
24
            Α
                  Yes.
25
                  Now, would you agree, Doctor,
0013
1
                           , D.D.S.
                                       13
 2
     that a dentist who's licensed to practice in
 3
     the State of New York should be able to
     recognize the difference between a molar and
 4
 5
     a cuspid?
 6
                        : Objection to the
                  MR.
 7
            form. I think it's very vague.
 8
                  MR. OGINSKI: I'll rephrase it.
 9
                  All of my questions are going
10
     to relate to the time period of
11
                  , okay --
12
                  Yes.
            Α
13
                  -- unless I indicate otherwise.
14
                                     , you were
15
     licensed to practice dentistry in the State
16
     of New York?
17
                 Right.
            Α
18
            Q
                  For how long have you been in
19
     practice approximately?
```

```
20
                   . Private practice
           Α
21
     maybe .
22
                 Now, on the date that you saw
23
            on
                                      that was
24
     the first date that you saw her, correct?
25
                As far as I can remember.
0014
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                      14
 2
                  You had never seen or treated
            Q.
 3
     her before that date?
 4
                 Not according to the chart
 5
     notes.
 6
                How was it that you came to
 7
     treat her on that date?
 8
                She had a referral from an
           Α
 9
     orthodontist.
10
                And the office where you were
           Q
     working that was ?
11
12
           Α
                 Yes.
13
                 And what was your relationship
           Q
14
          at that time?
     with
15
     Were you employed? Were you an owner? Were
16
     you a shareholder? What was your
17
     affiliation?
18
           Α
                  Employee.
19
                  And who employed you? In other
20
     words, who did you have your agreement with,
21
     as far as you know?
22
                 MR. : Objection to
23
            form.
24
                 What agreement?
           Α
25
                 Who hired you?
           Q
0015
1
                                      15
                          , D.D.S.
 2
           Α
3
                  Who's
            Q.
                 I guess he's like an office
           Α
 5
     manager there.
 6
                 And did you have a written
 7
     contract?
 8
           Α
                 I don't remember.
 9
                 Did you receive a check from
10
         on a regular basis?
11
          Α
                 Yes.
12
                  Did they take taxes out of your
13
     check?
14
                  Yes, I think so.
15
                  And if you wanted to take
     vacation time, did you have to square it
16
17
     away with the office to make sure that that
     time was good for them and for you?
18
19
                 I believe so.
           Α
20
           Q
                  Was your name on the door
21
     anywhere?
22
           Α
                 No.
23
           Q
                  Was your name on any of the
24
     billing statements?
25
           Α
                  I have no idea. I don't think
```

```
0016
1
                                       16
                          , D.D.S.
2
     so.
 3
                  Was your name on any of the
 4
     insurance documents sent to various health
 5
     insurance companies for payment?
 6
            Α
                  It's possible.
 7
                  Anything that you recall as you
            Q
8
     sit here today?
9
                  It was a long time ago. I was
            Α
10
     working in three offices at the time.
     Honestly, I only worked there one or two
11
     times a week. I don't remember.
12
13
           Q Did you have business cards
14
     made up with your name on it at
15
16
            Α
                  I don't think so.
17
                  Were you required to obtain
            Q.
18
     your own malpractice insurance?
19
                  Yes.
            Α
2.0
                  MR.
                        : Just note my
21
            objection to the last question in
22
            terms of its use at trial.
23
                 Before examining
24
        , did you review her chart?
25
                 Generally, especially before
            Α
0017
                          , D.D.S.
1
 2
     any surgical treatment, I'll always go over
 3
     the medical history. According to my notes
     it says I did review.
 5
                  Did you learn that this was a
            Q
6
                      ?
     patient of Dr.
 7
                  Well, I see several different
            Α
8
     handwritings in the chart so I don't know
     who, you know, generally saw her. But, you
9
10
     know, there's chart entries from several
11
     different people here. I don't know that
12
     they are all his; that it was only his
13
     patient. It's hard to tell.
14
                 When
                          and her mom came
15
     in on
                                    , did they
16
     specifically ask for you as their dentist?
                  I don't recall.
17
            Α
18
            Q
                  In other words, on the day that
19
     you were working, how was it that you
20
     treated her instead of any of the dentists
21
     who had treated her before?
22
                  Maybe because there may have
23
     not been any other dentist in the office
24
     that day.
25
                  Doctor, can you have deciduous
            Q
0018
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                        18
 2
     supernumerary teeth?
 3
            Α
                  Yes.
 4
            Q
                  How would you be able to
     distinguish between deciduous supernumerary
```

```
teeth and adult supernumerary teeth?
7
                  I thought deciduous was baby
8
     teeth.
9
                  You had mentioned that they
10
     were permanent.
11
                 Well, adult teeth are permanent
12
     as well so deciduous are also adult teeth.
13
                 Let me rephrase it. Are there
           Q
14
     supernumerary baby teeth?
15
                 There could be, sure.
            Α
16
                 How do you distinguish between
17
     a supernumerary baby tooth as opposed to a
18
     supernumerary adult tooth?
19
                 I'm not sure.
           Α
20
                 You are a general dentist,
21
     correct?
22
                  Yes.
           Α
23
                  You are not an oral surgeon?
            Q.
24
           Α
                 Nope.
25
           Q
                  As far as you know, Doctor, an
0019
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       19
 2
     oral surgeon continues on, does training
 3
               school?
     after
                  MR.
                        : Objection. I
 5
            don't know that's in the scope of
 6
            his knowledge.
7
                  MR. OGINSKI: Whatever his
8
            knowledge is.
9
                  Based upon your information?
10
                  MR.
                       : Over my
11
            objection, if you know. Do you know
12
            what training oral surgeons receive?
13
                  THE WITNESS: Yes.
14
                  MR.
                        : Okay. Over my
15
            objection.
16
                 How much additional training do
17
     they receive typically after school?
18
                Well, academically there is
19
     four and six-year programs. In the clinics,
20
     I believe both certifications receive
21
     four years training so it's a six or
22
     four-year program.
23
           Q For schooling and then some
24
     type of additional training after that?
25
                 No.
                           school is
           Α
0020
                          , D.D.S.
1
 2
     four years. To become an oral surgeon you
3
     have an additional four to six years.
                 In addition to the school?
           Q
 5
                  Yes.
            Α
 6
                 As a general dentist,
 7
     typically, after graduating
                                     school is
8
     four years, correct?
9
                      is four years.
           Α
10
            Q
                  And some dentists go on to do
11
     some type of residency?
```

```
12
           Α
                 Yes.
13
                 You did a one-year residency,
           Q
14
     correct?
15
                 A little over a year.
           Α
16
           0
                 That was at Hospital?
17
                 Correct.
           Α
18
           0
                 You did not do any type of
19
     fellowship, correct?
20
                 I did do a fellowship in
21
     implant dentistry but this was after this
22
    case. It's recent.
23
           Q.
              You did not do any residency in
24
     oral surgery?
25
           Α
                 It was a general practice
0021
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     residency but it was highly geared towards
 3
     oral surgery.
 4
                Would you agree, Doctor, that
           Q
 5
     an oral surgeon residency is different than
 6
     an general
                 residency, correct?
7
           Α
                 Yes.
8
                 In the course of your general
9
        practice, you perform extractions,
10
     correct?
11
           Α
                 Yes.
12
           Q
                When do you send a patient out
13
     to an oral surgeon to have extractions done?
           A When there's risk involved of
14
15
     nerve damage, medical history risk. You
16
     know, if there's extenuating circumstances
17
    based on their medical history; heeling
18
     problems. Not that often.
19
                How would you know if there was
20
     a possible nerve involvement in anticipation
21
    of performing an extraction?
22
           A From an X-ray you can see the
23
     proximity of the tooth to a nerve.
24
           Q And what would lead you, at
25
     that point, after evaluating an X-ray and
0022
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     realizing that there's something at risk or
3
     there's a risk of doing this, that you then
 4
     send a patient out to an oral surgeon?
 5
                 MR. : Objection to
 6
            form. Can you just read it back?
7
                 MR. OGINSKI: I'll rephrase it.
                 Explain to me why you would
9
     send a patient to an oral surgeon for an
10
     extraction as opposed to you doing it?
                 MR. : In addition to
11
           what he already said because he said
12
13
            if a film showed that it was close
14
           to a nerve, the root was close to a
15
           nerve.
16
                 MR. OGINSKI: Okay.
17
                 MR. : I don't know if
```

```
18
            that's his only reason he would.
19
                  Under those circumstances, why
20
     would you send a patient to a oral surgeon
21
     as opposed to you doing it?
22
                  Difficulty and risk.
23
                  What would the oral surgeon be
24
     able to do that you might not be able to do?
25
                  Probably nothing to be honest
0023
1
                                        23
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     with you. I'm an excellent surgeon but when
 3
     it comes to risk, oral surgeons have much
     better malpractice insurance. Or if I think
 5
     that something could happen, whether it was
     going to happen in my hands or his hands, it
 6
 7
     would happen either way, but he is more
 8
     equipped to deal with the situation if it
 9
     does happen because he has that extra
10
     training that I don't have.
11
                        : I'm going to
                  MR.
12
            make a motion at the time of trial
13
            to take out those portions that
14
            refer to malpractice insurance;
15
            otherwise that's a good stand.
16
            0
                  Is it your opinion, Doctor,
17
     that in general most oral surgeons have more
18
     experience dealing with extractions than
19
     general dentists?
20
            Α
                  Some.
21
                  How close does the nerve need
22
     to be to the root or to the tooth in order
23
     for you to make that decision about should I
24
     do it or should I send it out?
25
                  MR.
                         : Objection.
                                       Can
0024
1
                           , D.D.S.
 2
            you just read that back.
3
                  (Whereupon, the requested
 4
            portion of the transcript was read
 5
            back by the court reporter.)
 6
                  MR.
                         : Objection to
 7
            form.
 8
                  It's not a matter of
 9
     measurement. I make these decisions based
10
     on so many factors. It's not just where,
11
     you know, the nerve is. I've taken teeth
12
     out that were very close to the nerve.
13
                  There's a lot of factors that
14
     play into it; how the tooth is impacted.
15
     You know, the patient, if they're a patient
16
     that's nervous they need to be knocked out
17
     for the procedure, I don't knock patients
18
     out. So, you know, all those factors play
19
     into it, not just the proximity of the
20
     nerve. Patient management as well because
21
     of, you know, anesthesia that I don't do.
22
            Q.
                 Now, when
                                came into
23
     your office, did you see that there was a
```

```
request from her orthodontist to remove
25
     specific teeth?
0025
1
                                       25
                          , D.D.S.
2
                  Yes.
            Α
3
                  And do you see that note in the
           Q.
     chart that you have in front of you which is
5
     a photocopy?
6
           Α
                  Yes.
7
            Q
                  Can you show that to me,
8
    please.
9
            Α
                  (Complying.)
10
                  That's the letter dated
            Q
11
                         from Dr.
12
     correct?
13
                  Yes.
           Α
14
            Q
                  And that's addressed to Dr.
15
            ?
16
            Α
                  Yes.
17
                  Did you see a consult letter
            Q
                  to Dr. about
18
     from Dr.
19
    his examination of the patient around
20
21
                       : Are you asking
22
            if it's in this group of documents
23
            here?
                  MR. OGINSKI: No. I'm going to
24
25
            rephrase it.
0026
                          , D.D.S.
1
2
                  When you saw the patient on
            Q
3
                  , in addition to this letter,
4
     did you see another letter from Dr.
5
         to Dr.
                 ?
6
                 MR.
                        : Do you have a
7
            recollection of it?
8
                 Honestly, I don't remember.
9
     But, you know, I'm not sure.
10
                 MR. : Did you see any
11
            documents that were not part of the
12
            chart? Did you have any other
13
            documents outside of the chart?
14
                  THE WITNESS: Not that I know.
15
                  MR. : Counsel, is this
            a full chart? Are we saying that
16
            this is a full chart?
17
18
                  MR.
                        : That's my
19
            understanding.
20
                  MR. : We have
21
            Plaintiff's Exhibit 3 dated
22
                              . It is one, two,
23
            three, four, five, six pages that
24
            are stapled together and it's been
25
            indicated that this is the full
0027
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       27
 2
            chart or copy of the full chart and
 3
            counsel now will be providing
```

```
something which --
 5
                  Doctor, I'm going to show you a
     letter dated
                                     that is from
 7
     Dr. to Dr.
                     . Have you
     ever seen that letter before?
 8
 9
                 I'm not sure.
            Α
10
                 That letter discusses his
            0
11
     examination and evaluation of the patient
12
     from an orthodontic standpoint, correct?
13
                 I'm sorry?
           A
14
                 That letter that you you've
     just looked at that your attorney is also
15
16
     looking at, that discusses Dr.
17
     examination and evaluation of the patient
18
     from an orthodontist standpoint?
19
           Α
                 Yes.
20
                 It also makes recommendations
21
     in there in order to accomplish his
22
     orthodontic treatment of what needs to be
23
     done from a general
                           perspective,
24
     correct?
25
                  In other words, he makes
0028
1
                          , D.D.S.
     recommendations that certain teeth need to
 3
     be extracted?
           Α
                Yes.
 5
                  Doctor, if you can take a look
 6
     at the letter that you've shown me that
 7
     appears in the chart of the
         and these recommendations that he
 9
     makes compared to the letter that I've just
10
     shown you about the orthodontic treatment
11
     and evaluation, is it your understanding
12
     just looking at the two that they are the
13
     same? I'm asking specifically about the
14
     teeth that he is recommending be removed.
15
                  Yes.
            Α
                  MR. OGINSKI: Mark this.
16
17
                  (Plaintiff's Exhibit 4, Letter,
18
            was marked for identification.)
            A I made a mistake in the wording
19
20
     of a deciduous tooth versus a permanent.
21
            Q
                 Tell me, Doctor, what is a
22
     deciduous tooth?
23
            Α
                A baby tooth.
24
                  Is there any way for you to
25
     make a distinction or determine the
0029
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     difference between a baby tooth and an adult
 3
     tooth?
 4
            Α
                  Yes.
 5
                 How do you clinically make the
            Q.
 6
     distinction?
 7
                 Location, age of the patient,
           Α
 8
     X-ray, evaluation.
                 Now, when you extract a tooth
```

```
are there instances where you will need to
11
     cut the bone or create a gum flap?
12
                 Yes.
           A
13
                  Are there instances where you
14
     need to suture the patient?
15
                  Yes.
           Α
16
                  Would you agree, Doctor, that
17
     if your intent is to remove a baby tooth and
18
     instead you removed an adult tooth that
19
     would be a departure from good and accepted
20
         care?
21
                         : Note my
22
            objection to the form. You're
23
            asking for a legal conclusion.
24
                 Well, Doctor, if you intend to
25
     remove a baby tooth and for whatever reason
0030
                          , D.D.S.
1
 2
     instead don't remove a baby tooth but
 3
     instead remove a permanent tooth, would you
 4
     agree that would be a departure from good
 5
     and accepted
                     care?
 6
                  MR.
                        : Again, my
 7
            objection to form. In this
            circumstance? In this situation?
 8
 9
                  MR. OGINSKI: In general.
10
                  MR. : Can you answer
11
            that in general? Is that an answer
12
            you can give as a general
            proposition?
13
14
                 You mean to pull a baby tooth
            Α
15
     and you pull a permanent tooth, is that
16
     what?
17
                  Is that a departure from good
18
    care?
19
                  MR.
                        : Note my
20
            objection to the form.
21
                  I guess, yes.
            Α
22
                  Tell me why.
            Q
23
                 Because when you pull a tooth
            Α
24
     you should pull the proper tooth, you know.
25
            Q.
                 Now, when Dr.
0031
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       31
 2
     specific requests about teeth that he was
 3
     asking to have extracted, this was not your
 4
     treatment plan, correct, this was his
 5
     request and Dr.
                       's treatment plan
 6
     correct?
 7
           Α
                  Yes.
8
                  You would agree, Doctor, that
9
    before extracting any of those teeth that
10
     you correctly identify which teeth those
11
     were before performing the extraction,
12
     correct?
13
            Α
                  Yes.
14
            Q
                  Did you have a conversation
15
     with the patient, with
                             and her mom,
```

```
16
    before doing any extractions about whether
17
     to send her to an oral surgeon to have these
     extractions done?
18
19
                 I don't recall.
            Α
20
                  Tell me why you chose to
21
     perform extractions on this patient on
22
             instead of sending her to an
23
    oral surgeon?
2.4
                  MR.
                        : Note my
25
            objection to the form. Over
0032
1
                          , D.D.S.
            objection you can respond.
3
                 I've pulled tens of thousands
4
     of teeth. These appeared to be, you know,
     simple extractions. They did not seem
 5
 6
     complicated in any way or risky.
 7
                 As part of your discussion with
 8
     the patient or with the patient's parent or
 9
    mother in this case -- Let me rephrase.
10
                  Did you have a discussion with
11
         and her mom that they have the
12
    option to go to an oral surgeon to have
13
     these extractions done?
14
            Α
                 I don't recall.
15
                  When you evaluate and determine
     that the treatment plan to extract teeth are
16
17
     what you said simple, relatively
     straightforward, would you still have a
18
19
     discussion with the patient or the patient's
20
    parent about an option of going to an oral
21
     surgeon?
22
                  Could you repeat that?
           Α
23
            Q
                  Under what circumstances do you
24
     discuss with the patient or the patient's
25
    parent the option of going to an oral
0033
1
                         , D.D.S.
 2
     surgeon to have extractions done?
3
           A When I feel that the extraction
 4
     is out of my realm of dentistry.
 5
           Q You felt that was not something
 6
     out of the realm of what you could
 7
     accomplish, correct?
 8
            Α
                 Correct.
 9
                  Would it be fair to say based
10
     upon that, that it would be unlikely that
11
     you would have had a discussion with the mom
12
     about going to an oral surgeon to have the
13
     extractions done?
14
                  I suppose. I'm not a hundred
           Α
15
    percent.
16
                  Okay. If there were any teeth
17
                 was asking to be
    that Dr.
18
     extracted that you were unsure where they
19
    were anatomically, would you agree it would
20
    be good
               practice not to pull a tooth
21
     you were unsure whether or not it was the
```

```
22
    correct tooth?
23
          A I would never pull a tooth if I
24
    was unsure of what it was.
25
               What would your options be if,
           Q
0034
1
                         , D.D.S.
                                      34
2
    in fact, you were unsure about anatomically
3
    where that tooth was, whether it was the
4
    correct tooth that was being asked to be
5
    removed?
6
                       : This is
                 MR.
7
           hypothetical so I guess you should
           phrase it as one because he stated
9
           that was not what he believed it to
10
           be at the time. Hypothetically.
11
           Q If a doctor asked you to remove
12
    a particular tooth and you were unclear
13
    whether or not it was the correct tooth that
14
    you were about to extract, what would your
15
    options be at that point?
16
           A You're saying that if someone
17
    asked me to pull a tooth I was unsure? I'd
18
    probably call the doctor.
19
           Q
                 Why?
20
           Α
                 Just to verify, I guess, which
21
    tooth he wants me to pull.
           Q Now, Doctor, if you remove a
22
23
    permanent tooth, you can't simply put it
24
    back in if you learned it's the wrong tooth,
25
    correct?
0035
1
                          , D.D.S.
2
                 You could immediately. But
3
     once it's been out for a certain amount of
4
     time, you can't.
5
                 What is a certain amount of
6
    time?
7
                Depends. You know, it has to
    be under a half hour. Normally, if you
8
9
    remove a tooth, it needs to go back in
10
    within a half hour. I think anything over
11
    two hours the odds stop dropping
12
    drastically.
13
           Q
                 Now, you told me on the first
14
    question I asked you and you said that you
    had removed 's canine teeth on her
15
16
    lower jaw, correct?
17
           Α
                 Correct.
18
           Q
                 That would be on both the right
19
    and the left?
20
          A
                Yes.
21
                 If you look at Dr. 's
           Q
                             , where within
22
    letter from
23
    that request does it indicate that he would
    like those two canine teeth in the lower jaw
25
    removed?
0036
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                      36
```

```
It doesn't.
            Α
3
                  Can you explain to me if Dr.
         did not request that those teeth
 5
    be removed why you chose to remove those
 6
     particular teeth?
 7
                  I mistook the permanent canines
8
     for the deciduous canines due to the
9
     positioning on the X-ray.
10
                  Would you agree, Doctor, that
11
    by removing permanent canines when instead
12
     your intention was to remove deciduous
13
     canines, that that would be a departure from
14
     good and accepted
                           care?
15
            Α
                  Sorry?
16
                        : Over my
                  MR.
17
            objection you can answer.
18
                Would you agree, Doctor, that
19
    by removing the permanent canines when, in
     fact, your intention was to remove the
20
21
     deciduous canines, that would be a departure
22
     from good and accepted care?
23
                  MR.
                        : Again, objection
24
            to form.
25
                  Yeah, I guess.
0037
1
                                       37
                          , D.D.S.
 2
                  Tell me what is the implication
 3
     to the patient for removing permanent teeth
 4
     when, in fact, you were intending to remove
 5
     baby teeth?
 6
                  MR.
                        : For this
 7
            patient?
8
                  MR. OGINSKI: Yes.
9
                  MR. : What the
10
            ultimate result would be; is that
11
            what you're asking?
12
                  MR. OGINSKI: Not yet.
13
                  The fact that you removed
14
     permanent teeth when the permanent teeth
15
     were not intended to be removed, what's the
16
     implication from a general
17
     standpoint?
18
            Α
                  Well, typically, children at
19
    her age have permanent teeth removed all the
20
     time for orthodontic space. I think I more
21
     commonly remove permanent teeth to gain
22
     space orthodontically than I do baby teeth.
23
            Q.
                  If the permanent canines are
24
     removed, doesn't that then leave a
25
     significant gap in the lower jaw?
0038
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       38
 2
                  It depends on the space. What
 3
     I'm trying to say is permanent teeth are
     removed every day to make space so that
 5
     teeth can be aligned properly
 6
     orthodontically.
                  Let's talk about this patient
```

```
specifically. This patient's orthodontist,
 9
          , had evaluated this patient
10
     and came up with this treatment plan that
11
     these were the teeth to be extracted in
12
     order to make more space.
13
                  Any of these teeth that he
14
     requested to be removed, are any of these
15
     permanent ones that's listed in this letter?
16
            Α
                  The bicuspids.
17
            Q
                  The supernumerary first
18
     bicuspids on the lower?
19
                 Yeah. Didn't we say that
20
     bicuspids are a permanent tooth; that
21
     children do not have bicuspids?
22
                 Those are not the canines that
            Q
23
     you removed, correct?
24
            Α
                  No.
25
                  Doctor, I'm going to show you a
            Q.
0039
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                        39
 2
     copy of a Panorex X-ray taken on
 3
                   which has been marked
 4
     today as Plaintiff's Exhibit 1 for
 5
     identification and I'll ask you to take a
 6
     look at that. Do you see that, Doctor?
 7
            Α
                  Yes.
 8
            Q
                  At the time that you saw
 9
         on
                              , did you have a
10
     copy of the Panorex X-ray, of this
11
     particular Panorex X-ray?
12
                  According to the chart records,
            Α
13
14
                  And you would agree it's good
15
     practice to refer to X-rays prior to
16
    performing an extraction, correct?
17
                  Yes.
            Α
18
            0
                  And you want to identify
19
     anatomically where a tooth is before
20
     extracting it, correct?
21
            Α
                 Yes.
22
            Q
                  You also want to identify if
23
     there is any nerves close to the root of the
24
     tooth, correct?
25
            Α
                 Yes.
0040
1
                                       40
                          , D.D.S.
 2
                  And you want to see what the
 3
     adjacent structures are as well?
            Α
                  Yes.
 5
                  And X-ray will help you
 6
     identify the bone and see if there are any
 7
     anomalies or any problems in the area where
 8
     the extraction is to be performed?
 9
            Α
                  Yes.
10
                  In addition to that Panorex,
11
     Doctor, you also took bitewing X-rays on
12
13
            Α
                  It's possible.
```

```
14
                Do the notes that you have in
15
     front of you, the chart, reflect that you
     took any X-rays that day?
16
17
                 No.
           Α
18
            Q
                  Do you have the billing
19
     statement in there, Doctor?
20
            Α
                  Yes.
21
                  Does the billing statement
            Q
22
    reflect that the patient was billed for
23
    X-rays taken that day?
24
            Α
                  Yes.
25
            Q.
                  And what X-rays does it
0041
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       41
 2
     indicate were done that day?
 3
           A It says, exam for bitewing and
 4
     two bitewing. That's not my handwriting
 5
     though.
 6
                 I'm just asking if there's
 7
     something that indicates that X-rays were
8
     done that day?
9
           Α
                  Yes.
10
                  Now, in your handwritten note
11
     for your treatment of this patient, do you
12
     indicate that X-rays were taken before
13
    performing extractions?
           Α
14
                 No.
15
            Q
                  Do you indicate anything about
16
    X-rays having been taken that day?
17
                 No.
18
                  Would you agree that it's
            0
19
    better to take X-rays before doing
20
    extraction rather than after?
21
           Α
                 Yes.
22
            Q
                 Why?
23
                Because after it's too late.
24
    What purpose would an X-ray after a surgery
25
     serve you?
0042
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                      42
 2
                 Okay. Doctor, on the Panorex
 3
     film, which is Plaintiff's 1 for
     identification, can you point to me, please,
 4
 5
    where the supernumerary first bicuspids are
 6
     on this document?
 7
           Α
                  (Pointing.) Here.
 8
                  Okay.
9
                  MR. OGINSKI: Counsel, can I
10
           have him mark with an X or a line
            just to identify? If you can just
11
12
           draw a line straight down.
13
                 (Complying.)
           Α
14
            Q
                 Which ones are the
15
     supernumerary first bicuspids?
16
            Α
                 (Complying.)
                  Okay. Doctor, I've just
17
            Q
18
     written on the document duplicate
19
     supernumerary first bicuspids where you put
```

```
20
     the arrows.
21
                  Can you identify, please, on
     this X-ray where are the permanent canines
22
23
     on the lower jaw that you actually removed?
24
            Α
                  (Complying.)
25
            Q.
                  Okay. You marked that with an
0043
1
                           , D.D.S.
                                      43
 2
     X on both left and right, correct, on the
 3
     lower jaw?
 4
            Α
 5
            Q
                  Can you show me, Doctor, where
 6
     is the deciduous maxillary right first
 7
     molar?
 8
                  Maxillary?
            Α
 9
            Q
                  Yes.
10
            Α
                  Here (indicating).
11
                  Make a little circle to
            Q.
12
     differentiate it.
13
            Α
                  (Complying.)
14
                  Let me identify that. Can you
            Q.
15
     tell me, please, where the deciduous
16
     maxillary right cuspid is?
17
                  Here (indicating).
            Α
18
                  Doctor, where is the deciduous
19
     maxillary left cuspid?
20
            Α
                  (Complying.)
21
                  Can you please show me where
22
     the deciduous mandibular left first molar
23
24
            Α
                  (Complying.)
25
            Q
                  Can you please point out,
0044
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     Doctor, the deciduous mandibular right first
 3
     molar?
                  (Complying.)
 5
                 I'd like to show you, Doctor,
 6
     Plaintiff's Exhibit 2, which is another
 7
     Panorex taken of
                         . This
 8
     one is taken on
 9
                  MR.
                       : This is after
10
            the treatment.
11
                  MR. OGINSKI: Correct.
12
                  MR. : So because it's
13
            after the treatment and it would not
14
            be something that he would have
15
            reviewed for today, I'm going to
16
            object to it. Subsequent treatment
            records, he is not really here to
17
18
            testify to that.
                  Is it true, Doctor, that you
19
            Q
20
     did not see
                     after
21
                  Yes.
            Α
22
                  As you mentioned, you did not
23
     take any X-rays after the extractions,
24
     correct?
25
            Α
                  No.
```

```
0045
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                     45
2
                I want you to take a look at
     this Panorex X-ray which was taken
     admittedly after you had last seen her.
 5
     This is on
                                     by Dr.
 6
                  Just looking at this --
 7
                  MR. : I'm going to
8
            object again. You're asking him to
9
            review subsequent records and make
10
            comments. He is here to testify on
11
            his care and treatment.
12
                 MR. OGINSKI: I'm not asking
13
            him to comment on the subsequent
            care and treatment, I'm asking him
14
15
            to make an observation about what is
16
            contained on the X-ray. That's all
17
            based on his treatment of her on
18
19
                       : I don't think
                 MR.
20
            it's proper to ask him to comment on
21
            subsequent treatment records. It's
22
            just not done. It's not his care
23
            and treatment.
24
                  MR. OGINSKI: The only reason I
25
            ask is because he does not have any
0046
1
                          , D.D.S.
2
            subsequent X-rays to show and it's
3
            as if we have before and after
            photographs.
5
                  MR. : I understand but
6
            you have Dr. . You can
7
            ask him all the questions you want.
8
            It's not proper to have him do that.
9
                 MR. OGINSKI: I disagree. I
10
            don't want to argue with you about
11
            it.
12
                        : I gave you all
                  MR.
13
            the leeway on the first one. I have
14
            not objected to you marking it up.
15
            Identifying is not proper for him to
16
           have to look at subsequent treatment
17
            records. It's just not proper.
18
                  Doctor, in your general
19
    practice, you review X-rays every day,
20
     correct?
21
           Α
                  Yes.
22
                  Patients will sometimes come to
23
     you with X-rays from prior treatment,
24
     correct?
25
           Α
                 Yes.
0047
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                     47
                  You will take X-rays on your
            0
3
     own in your own office, correct?
4
                  Yes.
           Α
 5
            Q
                  Simply looking at the X-ray
```

```
I've provided to you, the one taken on
 7
                  , in the Panorex film is there
 8
     evidence of any permanent canine teeth on
9
     this film?
10
                 MR.
                       : Okay. Again, I
11
            have to object because I don't think
12
            it's appropriate for him to have to
13
            comment on subsequent care, and I'm
14
            not sure where you're leading.
15
                  If this is the only question
16
            you're going to ask about this
17
            document, I'll permit it over my
           objection but if you're trying to
18
19
           use it to open the door to ask him
           what should be done for this
20
21
           patient --
22
                 MR. OGINSKI: No, no, I only
            want to make an observation about --
23
24
                 MR. : You understand
25
           why I'm objecting?
0048
1
                                      48
                          , D.D.S.
 2
                  MR. OGINSKI: I got it.
 3
                      : So this is the
            one and only question you're asking
 5
            on this. Over my objection, you can
 6
            answer.
 7
            Α
                 You want to know if there are
 8
     canines on the bottom here?
9
                 Correct.
           Q.
10
            Α
                 No.
11
                 Thank you. Doctor, I want to
            0
12
     show you X-rays that were provided to me by
13
         in this pack and
14
     there are four of them here dated
15
                 . And also, in a separate
16
     one, which is a PA film also, if we can just
17
     keep them separate.
18
                 (Complying.) They are already
           Α
19
     mixed.
20
           Q
                  Okay.
21
                 These are four bitewings.
22
     These are all deciduous teeth. I mean this
23
     X-ray -- Where did you get this X-ray from?
24
           Q It came within the material
25
     provided to me by
0049
1
                          , D.D.S.
     when we asked them, in a packet with an
 3
     envelope.
                 According to this X-ray it
 5
     looks like the permanent canines are still
 6
     in the bone and those are deciduous canines.
 7
     If you want to take a look at that.
                 MR.
                      : So you're saying
 9
            that this supports --
10
                 The extractions. Believe it or
11
     not, yeah.
```

```
12
                 MR.
                       : That was taken
13
           before the extractions.
14
                 If this is her mouth, even now
15
     looking at this, I would say that the
     deciduous canines are present and that these
16
17
     are -- the permanent canines are directly
18
    below.
19
                       : This would have
                 MR.
20
           to be preoperative.
21
                 Yeah.
22
                 MR.
                       : This is coming
23
            out of an envelope that is dated 2
24
           PA, four bitewings,
25
                 Without seeing the original
0050
1
                         , D.D.S.
 2
     records or the original films, is there any
 3
     way for you to identify that small little
 4
     film in your hands as being
                                   's as
 5
     opposed to any other patient?
 6
                 Just by what's labeled on the
           Α
 7
     envelope here (indicating).
8
           Q
                 And when you take these
9
    bitewing X-rays and the PA X-rays, do they
10
     get put into some little page that gets
11
     clipped in?
12
           Α
                 They get put in these envelopes
13
     and the envelopes get put in the chart.
14
           Q
                 There is no actual identifying
15
     information on that small little X-ray for
     the patient's name or other patient
16
17
     information, correct?
18
           Α
                 Not on any of the X-rays. It
19
     looks that way.
20
                 MR.
                       : Doctor, just to
21
           be clear, your review of that
22
           particular X-ray, what type of film
23
           is that?
24
                 THE WITNESS: Periapical.
25
                 MR.
                       : And it includes
0051
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
           which teeth?
3
                 THE WITNESS: It has permanent
4
            twenty -- It looks like it has
 5
            permanent 22 through 27.
 6
                 MR.
                      : In your opinion,
 7
            that supported the type of
 8
           extraction that you performed that
9
           day?
10
                 THE WITNESS: Yes.
11
                 MR. : Do you know
12
           whether you saw that particular film
13
           before you did the extraction?
14
                 THE WITNESS: It would make
15
           sense that this film would, you
16
           know, cause me to do those
17
           extractions.
```

```
18
                Which extractions are you
19
     referring to?
20
           Α
                  The extractions that were done
21
     the day of treatment.
22
                  MR. : Do you know who
23
            took that film?
24
                  THE WITNESS: I don't.
25
                  Doctor, let's be specific. The
           0
0052
1
                                       52
                          , D.D.S.
2
     canine, the adult canines that you removed,
 3
     are they visible in that PA that you're
    holding?
 5
           Α
                 Yes, nut they are under the
 6
     gum. So they could not have been removed
 7
     according to this X-ray.
8
                 Wait a minute. I want to
           Q
9
     understand.
10
          Α
                 The permanent canines are still
11
     in the bone in this X-ray is my point.
12
                 That would be a preextraction
13
    X-ray?
14
                 Preextraction X-ray which means
15
     for me to get to those teeth there is no way
16
     that I could have taken these teeth out that
17
     day.
18
                  MR. : Can you look at
19
           the Panorex and that film and say
20
           whether or not --
21
                 It doesn't make sense to be
           Α
22
    honest with you.
23
                 Just based upon what you've
           Q
24
    told us, is it possible that that film that
25
     you're holding in your hand is not this
0053
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
    patient's X-ray?
3
           A I mean it's possible that any
4
     of these films are not the patient's X-ray.
 5
     I don't have the patient in front of me to
 6
     verify.
 7
                 Based upon the Panorex film,
 8
    based upon the two Panorex films that I have
9
     in front of you.
10
           Α
                 I'm saying according to this
11
     film the deciduous canines are still
12
    present.
13
                 MR.
                       : Because they are
14
           under the bone.
15
                  THE WITNESS: No, the baby
16
            canines are still present according
17
            to this film.
18
                  MR. : Okay.
19
                  THE WITNESS: There is two sets
           of canines here in this film.
20
21
                 MR. : Can you compare
22
           it to the Panorex and say whether
23
           it's different?
```

```
24
                  THE WITNESS: I mean incisors
25
            look the same. It's amazing. I'm
0054
1
                          , D.D.S.
2
            amazed by the discrepancy here. I
3
            don't understand.
                  Now, if you were presented with
 5
     this discrepancy, as you've just described
6
     that, would that periapical X-ray, the
7
     Panorex and the patient sitting in front
8
     you, what options did you have at that point
 9
     in order to determine for sure which teeth
10
    would be extracted?
11
                  MR.
                         : This is
            hypothetical because we don't know
12
            which film he had or looking at at
13
14
            the time. You have not laid a
15
            foundation on which one he would
            rely on or whether it was both of
16
17
            them.
18
            Α
                  I'm sorry.
19
            Q
                  I want you to assume that Mrs.
        , the patient's mother, was in the
20
21
     room with you at the time that these
22
     extractions were being done and that she has
23
     testified that you continued throughout the
     course of the extractions to refer to the
24
25
     X-ray, the small X-rays that you have in
0055
                          , D.D.S.
1
 2
     front of you together with the Panorex and
 3
            's letter, was that consistent
 4
     with what you would expect to do in this
 5
     situation?
 6
            Α
                  Yes.
 7
                  And that if you were unsure
 8
     about which tooth or teeth to remove that
 9
     you would have stopped and done something
     else in order to verify a particular tooth
10
11
     and the anatomical structure where it was
12
     located?
13
                 As I said before, if I pulled
     teeth, I was certain of which teeth they
14
15
     were at the time. You know, I don't
16
     remember ever being uncertain about teeth.
17
                 Then explain to me how you
18
    pulled the permanent canine teeth as opposed
19
    to removing the deciduous canine teeth?
                  MR.
20
                        : His medical
21
            basis at that time. What was your
22
            understanding at that time looking
23
            at the films?
24
                  That was my understanding at
25
     that time.
0056
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       56
 2
            Q
                  What was?
 3
            Α
                  That I was pulling the correct
```

```
teeth.
 5
                 Did you learn before this
     lawsuit was started -- did you learn you had
 7
     removed incorrect teeth or teeth that were
 8
     not intended to be removed?
 9
                  No.
            Α
10
            0
                  Did you ever have a
11
     conversation with Dr.
                               after
12
13
            Α
                  No.
14
                 Did you ever have a
15
     conversation with Dr. about the
16
     teeth that you did remove?
17
            Α
                  No.
18
                 Did you ever have a discussion
19
     with any dentist at
20
     about the teeth that you had removed?
21
            Α
                  No.
22
            0
                  Dr.
                          says in his
23
     evaluation, orthodontic evaluation to Dr.
24
        , he says there are bilateral
25
     unerupted supernumerary first bicuspids.
0057
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     What does that mean to you?
 3
                 It means that there are teeth
     on either side of the lower jaw that are
 4
 5
     extra and unerupted.
 6
            Q
                  And unerupted means they are
 7
     below the skin line or gum line?
 8
                 Below the tissue, yes.
            Α
 9
            Q
                  So you are not able to
10
     visualize by looking at them?
11
            Α
                  No.
12
                  You would only be able to see
            Q
13
     them on X-ray?
14
            Α
                  Yes.
15
                 Now, on the Panorex you pointed
16
     out to me the supernumerary first bicuspids
17
     on the lower jaw on both the left and right?
18
            Α
                  Yes.
                  Okay. Do any of the X-rays
19
     that you took that day or had taken that
20
21
     day, show the area of the supernumerary
22
     first bicuspids, the areas you've identified
23
     here on the Panorex?
24
            Α
25
                  The canine teeth that you have
            Q.
0058
 1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     identified in the Panorex, are they erupted?
 3
                 You can't see tissue on the
 4
     X-rays. It seems that they are but I can't
 5
     say looking at them now, you know, that they
     are erupted.
            Q
                  Are you able to compare the
 8
     other four bottom teeth, the ones in the
     center, in relation to the canines that you
```

```
10
     did remove as to whether or not you would
11
     expect these to be erupted based upon how
12
     they appear in the Panorex?
13
                 They seem as they would be but
            Α
     there is no quarantee that they were visual
14
15
     in the mouth at that time.
16
                  The supernumerary first
17
     bicuspids on the lower left and right, those
18
     clearly are unerupted on the Panorex?
19
            Α
                 Yes.
20
                 And you would agree based upon
21
            's request that it was these
22
     teeth that were to be extracted on
23
                  on the day that you were
24
     performing the extractions, correct?
                        : Note my
25
                  MR.
0059
                          , D.D.S.
1
 2
            objection. Can you at least let him
 3
            look at the order?
 4
                  MR. OGINSKI: Yes.
 5
                  MR.
                        : Actually, the
 6
            other order.
 7
                  Yes, that's fine. I could see
     it there on that referral. You know, these
 9
     teeth.
10
                  Just be specific which ones
11
     you're pointing to.
12
            Α
                  The supernumerary first
13
     bicuspid.
14
            Q
                  Okay. So that was one of the
15
     sets of teeth that Dr.
                              asked to
16
     be extracted, correct?
17
            Α
                  Yeah.
18
                  And based upon the Panorex that
19
     you identified, those are clearly unerupted,
20
     right?
21
            Α
                  Yes.
22
                  And did you extract those teeth
            Q
23
     on
24
                  No.
            Α
25
            Q.
                  Why not?
0060
 1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       60
 2
            Α
                  I'm not sure. Those teeth are
 3
     still what appears to be under the bone.
 4
     That would actually make for a difficult
 5
     extraction. I don't know that I would do an
     extraction.
 7
                  Would you agree, Doctor, that
 8
     extracting, based upon the placement within
 9
     the bone as seen on the Panorex, that the
10
     supernumerary first bicuspid on the left and
11
     right would, in your words, be a difficult
12
     extraction?
13
            Α
                  Yes.
14
                  In that instance, it would be
15
              care to refer the patient out to
```

```
an oral surgeon to have those teeth
17
     extracted?
                        : Note my
18
                  MR.
19
            objection to form.
20
                  Yes.
            Α
21
                  Why?
            Q
22
            Α
                  You said it was a difficult
23
     extraction.
2.4
                  Did you refer the patient to an
            Q
25
     oral surgeon to have those supernumerary
0061
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     first bicuspids extracted?
 3
            Α
                 No.
 4
                  Is there a reason why you did
 5
     not?
 6
            Α
                  I'm not sure.
 7
                  You've told me that you did not
 8
     extract those teeth. Would you agree it
 9
                      practice to refer the
     would be good
10
     patient to an oral surgeon to have those
11
     supernumerary first bicuspids extracted?
12
                       : Objection. He
                  MR.
13
            just answered that question.
14
                  Yes.
            Α
15
                  Did you have a conversation
16
     with Mrs.
                  towards the end of the
     treatment visit that you told her that you
17
18
     extracted two additional teeth that was not
19
     requested to be removed?
20
                  I don't recall.
            Α
21
                  The assistant who was with you
            Q
22
     in the room at the time of these
23
     extractions, do you recall who that was?
24
                  No.
            Α
25
                  Do you recall if it was a man
0062
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       62
 2
     or a woman?
 3
            Α
                  No.
 4
                  I want you to assume that Mrs.
 5
         has testified that she was
 6
     present in the room during the entire
 7
     duration that you were extracting
 8
     teeth and that there was a female assistant
 9
     in the room, and that she had a young baby
10
     or child in the room at that time. Does
11
     that refresh your memory as to who that
12
     might have been?
13
            Α
                  No.
14
                           has testified
                  Mrs.
15
     that this was a young child running in and
16
     out of the treatment room during the course
17
     of your extractions. Do you have any memory
18
     of that fact?
19
                 No.
            Α
2.0
                  Are you still employed at
        ?
21
```

```
22
           A
                No.
23
                 How long have you continued to
           Q
24
     work there?
25
                 How long did I continue to work
           Α
0063
                          , D.D.S.
1
                                       63
2
     there from this day?
3
           Q From the time you started until
4
     the time you left.
5
                 I'm not exactly sure. It was
           Α
 6
     not very long.
7
            Q.
                  Approximately?
8
                  A year, maybe, if that. Under
            Α
9
     a year.
                  After working there, where did
10
11
     you go?
12
                 I went to an office in
           Α
13
                 What was that name?
14
            0
15
                  It was doctors,
           Α
16
     and
17
            Q
                  How long did you work there?
18
           Α
                  Approximately two-and-a-half,
19
     three years.
20
           Q
                  After that, where did you work?
21
            Α
                  I worked where I work
22
     currently.
                  Which is where?
23
           Q
24
            Α
                  My practice in
25
            Q.
                  What's the name of that?
0064
1
                                   64
                          , D.D.S.
2
           Α
3
4
                 Is that a professional
           Q
5
     corporation or something else?
6
           Α
                 It's a corporation.
7
                 What is your title there? Are
8
     you an owner, president, shareholder or
9
     something else?
10
           Α
                 Owner, I guess. Owner and
11
    president.
12
           0
                 Now, you mentioned in
13
           you were working at a few other
14
     offices?
15
                  One of these was in here,
16
     sorry.
17
                  That's okay. You mentioned you
     were working also in two other offices in
18
19
                        , what were the other two
20
     offices?
                  I don't remember.
21
           Α
22
           Q
                  Where were they?
23
           Α
                  I don't know to be honest with
24
     you. Maybe
25
           Q
                 How long did you work in those
0065
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                     65
```

```
other two offices?
 3
                  Around the same time.
            Α
4
                  And what was your general
 5
     responsibility for treating patients there?
 6
                  Same.
 7
                  General dentist?
            Q
8
            Α
                  Yeah.
9
                  By the way, when you treated
10
         at
               , as a
11
     dentist who came in one or two days a week,
12
     were you required to bring in your own
13
     instruments?
14
            Α
                  No.
15
            Q
                  So you used the office's
16
     instruments?
17
            Α
                  Yes.
18
                  Did you consult with any doctor
19
     while caring for
                          on
20
21
                  I believe I spoke with Dr.
            Α
22
         that day but I'm not sure. I'm
23
     being honest with you. I really don't
24
     remember.
25
                  Why would you have spoken to
            Q.
0066
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                        66
 2
     him that day?
 3
            Α
                  I don't know if I spoke to him
 4
     or someone in his office. I'm not sure. I
 5
     vaguely remember calling his office. I
 6
     don't know why and I don't know if I spoke
 7
     to him.
8
                  Did you make a note of any
9
     conversation you had with whoever was there?
10
                  No.
11
                  Can you turn, please, to the
12
     office notes and I'd like you to read,
13
     please, your entire note into the record.
14
     And if there's an abbreviation, just tell me
15
     what it represents.
16
                 Patient presents with
17
     orthodontic extraction requests. Reviewed
18
     medical history, no significant findings.
19
     Three carpules of two percent Lidocaine.
20
     One to 100,000 Epinephrine given. Consent
21
     signed by mother. Numbers B, C, G, H, L, S and
22
     22, 27 supernumeraries, as per orthodontic
     request. No sutures. Post-op instructions
23
24
     given. Next visit, recall.
25
                  Now, numbers 22 and 27, that
            Q
0067
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                        67
 2
     was your understanding of where the
 3
     supernumerary first bicuspids were or is
     that -- Tell me what the 22 and 27 refer to.
 5
                  That refers to me thinking that
            Α
 6
     there were supernumerary cuspid teeth
     present.
```

```
Is it your understanding that
9
     that, in fact, was not the case?
10
                 MR. : You mean as he
11
            sits here today?
12
                  As you sit here now.
            Q
13
                  Today, yes.
            Α
14
            0
                  Have you spoken with any of
15
        's treating doctors that she has seen
16
     after this treatment in
17
            Α
                 No.
18
                  Have you reviewed any records
19
     relating to 's ongoing
                                 care
20
     and treatment?
21
            Α
22
                  Have you reviewed any of her
23
                 records?
     orthodontic
24
           Α
                  No.
25
            Q.
                  If you were to have referred a
0068
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                      68
 2
     patient to an oral surgeon, who would you
 3
     have referred them to? Again, this is back
 4
 5
                 I'm not sure.
 6
                 Would you have asked somebody
 7
     in the office as to who the doctors
     typically refer out to or did you have
 8
     somebody that you would personally refer to?
 9
10
            A
                 I don't recall. But,
11
     typically, when you work in an office, you,
12
     I guess, refer to specials that that office
13
     normally refers to.
14
                 Other than the note that you
           Q
15
     just read to me, did you do any charting on
16
         chart that you see here on the
     first page of her notes?
17
                I don't see any additional
18
           A
19
     charting, no.
20
                 The first page that we're
            Q
21
     looking at here, what is this page? Is this
     a billing page, a treatment record? What is
22
23
     that?
24
            Α
                  I guess it could be both.
25
            Q
                  And is there anything contained
0069
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     on this page in your handwriting?
 3
                  Yeah, right here (indicating).
            Α
                  Can you tell me what you're
 5
     referring to?
 6
                  It says "XOB."
            Α
 7
                  What is that?
            Q
 8
            Α
                  What?
 9
            Q.
                  "XOB"?
10
            Α
                  That means extractions of tooth
11
     В.
12
            Q
                  The column underneath lists?
13
            Α
                  Other extractions that were
```

```
14
     done.
15
                 And the letters refer to baby
     teeth, correct?
16
17
                  $40.
           Α
18
            0
                  That refers to baby teeth,
19
     correct?
20
            Α
                  Yes.
21
                  You treated this patient
            Q
22
     without regard to whether or not the patient
23
     had insurance or was paying out-of-pocket,
24
     correct?
25
           Α
                  I don't really deal with
0070
1
                          , D.D.S.
 2
     insurance to verify that at all.
 3
           Q In other words, patients before
 4
     you, you're treating them, you're doing
 5
     whatever has to be done at that time,
 6
     correct?
 7
                 Yes.
           Α
 8
                 And they deal with the payment
           Q.
 9
     issues after they leave you?
10
          A
                 Before or after. I don't know
11
     how that office operated.
12
           0
                 The informed consent that is
13
     typically given to the patient before
14
     extractions are done, who gives them that
15
     consent; is it a nurse, an assistant or
16
     something else?
17
                 Usually an assistant but, you
           Α
18
     know, I usually review it at some point
19
     before to make sure it's signed.
20
                 Okay. And do you do that in
           Q
21
     consultation?
22
                 Any surgical procedure.
23
                 In this particular instance,
24
     did you have the patient's mother sign the
25
     consent form?
0071
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                   71
 2
                  Yes.
            Α
 3
                 And how long was your
 4
     discussion with her about consent?
 5
           A I don't recall.
 6
           Q
                  Did you discuss with her the
 7
     risks of extractions?
 8
                 Typically I do.
 9
                  Do you have a specific memory
10
     of having a conversation with Ms.
11
           's proposed extractions?
     about
12
                  I don't recall having a
13
     conversation but typically I discuss the
14
     consent form with the person before they
15
     sign it; be it the patient or the mother. I
16
     ask them if they have any questions and go
17
     over anything that may be pertinent to the
18
     type of surgery we're doing that day.
19
                 Focusing specifically on this
```

```
20
                           , when you spoke
    patient on
21
    to the patient's mom, was in the
22
     room at the same time?
23
                 I don't recall.
            A
24
                  Did you specifically tell mom
            Q
25
     what teeth were going to be extracted?
0072
1
                        , D.D.S. 72
: Objection. He
 2
                  MR.
 3
            just said he does not have a
 4
            specific recollection. He testified
 5
            to his practice, now you're
 6
            following up.
 7
                  MR. OGINSKI: I'm just probing
 8
            a little bit.
 9
                 MR. : You're trying to
            refresh his recollection.
10
11
                  MR. OGINSKI: Fair enough.
                  Doctor, as you sit here now, do
12
            Q
13
     you have a memory of talking to Mrs.
14
         about the specific teeth you were
15
     going to be removing?
16
            Α
                 No.
17
            Q.
                 Let's go back, please, to Dr.
18
        's request to extract teeth. Is
19
     there anything in his letter that is
20
     ambiguous about which teeth he wanted
21
     removed?
22
            Α
                  No.
23
                 Was it your understanding that
     the reason to extract these particular teeth
25
     was because of overcrowding?
0073
1
                                   73
                          , D.D.S.
 2
            Α
                  Yes.
 3
            Q
                  You went to
           Α
                 Yes.
 5
            Q
                 When did you graduate?
 6
            Α
 7
            Q
                  Started in ?
 8
            Α
                  Yes.
 9
            Q
                  And went to
10
     undergrad?
           Α
11
                 Yes.
12
            Q
                 And after
                                   school,
13
     you told me you did a little bit more than a
14
     year in residency?
15
                     Hospital.
            Α
                  After that, did you do any
16
            Q
17
     additional training?
18
                  Training in?
            Α
19
                  In anything.
            Q
20
                  Yeah, we're required to take a
            Α
21
     certain number of credits per year of
22
     continuing education which I keep up with.
23
            Q
                 And you're a member of certain
24
         societies?
25
            Α
                 Yes, the
```

```
0074
1
                          , D.D.S. 74
2
3
                 Are you an officer of any of
     those organizations?
5
                 No. I'm also a member of the
6
7
                Have you written in the field
8
     of dentistry for any publications?
9
                 No.
           Α
10
                 Have you published any peer
11
     review in the field of dentistry?
12
           Α
                 No.
13
           Q
                  Have you lectured to any body
14
     of dentists?
15
           Α
                  No.
16
                  Have you ever testified before?
            Q
17
           Α
                  No.
18
           Q
                  Do you know Dr.
19
           Α
                  I don't know.
20
            Q
                  How many dentists worked at
21
         during the time that
22
    you worked there?
23
                  I have no idea.
            Α
24
            Q
                  Can you approximate, please.
25
            Α
0075
1
                          , D.D.S.
                  Now, did you ask the patient to
            Q
3
     return for follow-up after
           Α
                  It says, next visit, recall.
5
                  What does that mean?
6
                  Recall appointment, follow-up.
7
            Q
                 As far as you know, did the
8
    patient ever return to
9
10
                 According to the chart records,
           Α
11
                        of that year.
     they returned in
12
                 Are you able to tell who saw
           Q
13
     the patient that time?
14
           Α
                 No.
15
                  Was the patient examined at
16
     that time?
17
           Α
                 I don't know. I wasn't there.
18
                  Based upon the record you have
            Q
19
     in front of you.
20
                 It's illegible to me. I don't
21
    know exactly what that is.
22
                  MR.
                        : Off the record.
23
                  (At this time, a brief
            discussion was held off the record.)
24
25
                Doctor, the treatment above
0076
1
                          , D.D.S.
     yours in the chart, when is the last date
3
    that's reported there that the patient was
4
     in that office?
                  '06.
           Α
```

```
What was the exact date,
 7
     please?
 8
9
                  What was done on that date?
10
                  I believe sealants were done.
11
                  Did you ever learn from anyone
12
     except your attorney about the specific
13
                    did not return to the
     reason why
14
         office after
15
                  ?
16
17
                  Did you ever have a phone
18
     conversation with either
                                or her
     mother shortly after your treatment of
19
20
         on
21
                  Not that I know of.
22
                  MR. OGINSKI: Off the record.
23
                  (At this time, a brief
            discussion was held off the record.)
24
25
                  How long did it take you to
0077
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       77
 2
     perform all these extractions on
 3
                  2
                  I don't recall.
            Α
 5
                  What did you do with the teeth
     that you extracted? Did you send them to
 6
 7
     pathology? Did you throw them out? What
 8
     did you do with them?
 9
                  I don't remember.
            Α
10
                  Did you give the teeth to the
            0
11
     patient or to her mother?
12
            A Typically, I don't do that
13
     because, you know, they're sources of
14
     infection normally.
15
                  I want you to assume that Mrs.
         has testified that after these
16
17
     extractions were done you gave her or her
18
     daughter all the teeth that you had
19
     extracted. Does that refresh your memory?
20
                  No.
21
                  MR. OGINSKI: Thank you.
22
                  MR.
                       : I guess we'll be
23
            doing a D&I for those.
24
                  MR. OGINSKI: You guys saw
25
            them. The patient produced them.
0078
1
                          , D.D.S.
                                       78
 2
            Thank you.
 3
                  MR.
                        : No questions.
 4
            Thank you.
 5
                  (Time noted: 11:57 a.m.)
 6
 7
 8
                             , DDS
 9
10
```

11 12 13 14 15	Subscribed and sworn to before me this day of, .		
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	NOTARY PUBLIC		
0079		7.0	
1 2	INDEX	79	
3	WITNESS EXAMINATION BY		PAGE
4	Mr. Oginski	5	
5			
6	EXHIBITS		D3.68
7 8	PLAINTIFF'S DESCRIPTION Exhibit 1 Panoray Y-rays		PAGE 5
9	Exhibit 1 Panorex X-rays, Exhibits 2-3 Documents		5
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Exhibit 4 Letter		28
20			
21 22			
23			
24			
25			
0080		0.0	
1 2	ERRATA SHEET FOR THE TRANSCRIPT OF:	80	
3	Case Name: vs		
	Date:		
4 5	Witness: , DDS		
	CORRECTIONS		
6	PG LN NOW READS SHOULD READ REASON	F∩R	
7	10 PM MON VEWDO SHOOTH VEWN VEWSON	LOK	
8			
9			
10			
11			

22 23 Subscribed and sworn to before me	
24 this, day of, .	
25 (NOTARY PUBLIC)	
0081	
1 81	
2 CERTIFICATION	
3 I, , a Notary Public in 4 and for the State of New York, do hereby certify	
5 THAT the witness whose testimony is herei	
6 before set forth, was duly sworn by me; and	.11
7 THAT the within transcript is a true reco	rd
8 of the testimony given by said witness.	
9 I further certify that I am not related,	
10 either by blood or marriage, to any of the parti 11 to this action; and	.es
12 THAT I am in no way interested in	
13 the outcome of this matter.	
14 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto	
15 set my hand this	
16 17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
25	
23 24	